

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Involving Allegations of Domestic Servitude





Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Involving Allegations of Domestic Servitude

Domestic workers in the United States routinely experience wage theft and labor exploitation. These workers, many of them immigrant women, are also vulnerable to human trafficking for forced labor. Nearly one-third of civil human trafficking cases filed in federal courts in the past 15 years stemmed from allegations of domestic servitude. In domestic servitude cases, traffickers hold their victims in forced labor in the home, requiring them to cook, clean, and care for children. Domestic workers filing trafficking suits often describe being subjected to inhumane living conditions, forced to work around the clock for little or no pay. In the most extreme cases, domestic workers experience physical and/or sexual violence.

The table below lists all federal civil domestic servitude cases filed between the enactment of the civil provision of the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act in 2003 and November 2018. Of the 96 cases, more than half - 49 cases - settled. Of the remaining cases, 11 are ongoing, 14 were voluntarily dismissed, 16 ended with judgments for plaintiffs, 4 were involuntarily dismissed, and 2 were dismissed without prejudice.

The total amount of money ordered in public settlements and final court judgments in federal civil domestic servitude cases is \$19,008,852.55. Many settlements are confidential, so this number represents a fraction of total awards.

If you are aware of additional federal human trafficking civil cases involving allegations of domestic servitude, please contact The Human Trafficking Legal Center at info@htlegalcenter.org.

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
1	Abafita v. Aldukhan	1:16-cv-06072 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
2	Ara v. Khan	1:07-cv-1251 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (9/25/08)
3	Arma v. Prakoso	8:14-cv-03113 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (4/8/15)
4	Ayapponey v. Kunikiraman	1:08-cv-04133 (N.D.Ill.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (8/20/08)
5	Balite v. Bishman	6:11-cv-6252 (D.Or.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (8/15/12; dismissed 10/9/12)
6	Ballesteros v. Al-Ali	1:11-cv-00152 (D.R.I.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$1,231,800 (8/14/12)
7	Baoanan v. Baja	1:08-cv-05692 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (6/24/11)
8	Barjo v. Cherian	8:18-cv-01587 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
9	Baxla v. Chaudhri	1:16-cv-01218 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (4/13/17)
10	Bergado v. Velonza	2:17-cv-9070 (C.D.Cal.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
11	Bhardwaj v. Dayal	1:11-cv-04170 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (7/5/12)

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
12	Blanco v. Perdomo	1:13-cv-20374 (S.D.Fla.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (10/24/13)
13	Bolocon v. Sermoneta	1:16-cv-00521 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (5/23/16)
14	Bonilla v. Buch	1:18-cv-02092 (D.Colo.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
15	Brojer v. Kuriakose	2:11-cv-03156 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (not voluntarily, with prejudice, for failure to prosecute) (8/19/13)
16	Butigan v. Al-Malki	1:13-cv-00514 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (2/14/17) (prior default judgment for \$492,717 vacated)
17	C.G.B. v. Santa Lucia	2:15-cv-03401 (D.N.J.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (currently on appeal to Third Circuit (18-01091))
18	Canal v. de la Rosa Dann	09-cv-3366 (N.D.Cal.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$618,812.82 (9/6/11)
19	Carazani v. Zegarra	1:12-cv-00107 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$1,188,688.77 (7/3/13)
20	Chere v. Taye	2:04-cv-06264 (D.N.J.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (11/21/06)
21	Chigangu v. NDusha	5:14-cv-00062 (E.D.Ky.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (3/14/16)

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
22	Cruz v. Maypa	1:13-cv-00862 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled in the amount of \$140,000 (10/26/15) (initially dismissed; Fourth Circuit reversed (13-2362) (12/1/14))
23	Cruz v. Toliver	5:04-cv-231 (W.D.Ky.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Judgment for plaintiff in the amount of \$68,318 (jury award) (7/28/06) (Sixth Circuit affirmed (06-06113) (11/2/07))
24	De Jesus v. Hussein	09-cv-285 (N.D.Tex.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (3/25/09)
25	Dlamini v. Babb	1:13-cv-02699 (N.D.Ga.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Judgment for plaintiff in the amount of \$365,000 (jury award) (4/28/15)
26	Doe v. Amal	1:12-cv-01359 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (8/26/13)
27	Doe v. Howard**	1:11-cv-01105 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$3,306,468 (9/4/12)
28	Doe v. Khobragade	1:18-cv-11134 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
29	Doe v. Penzato	3:10-cv-05154 (N.D.Cal.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (12/6/13)
30	Doe v. Siddig	1:10-cv-01256 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (9/27/11)
31	DSouza v. Lobo	2:09-cv-00410 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (8/17/10)

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
32	Edwards v. Edwards	8:12-cv-03761 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (7/22/15)
33	Elat v. Ngoubene	8:11-cv-2931 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (7/9/14)
34	Eusebio v. Assaf	1:11-cv-00811 (N.D.Ill.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (9/26/11)
35	Fernandes v. Hayes	6:11-cv-00137 (W.D.Tex.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$830,027 (4/27/12)
36	Franco v. Diaz	1:14-cv-1909 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (12/3/14)
37	Garcia v. Curtright	6:11-cv-06407 (D.Or.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (3/14/13)
38	Garnica v. Edwards	1:13-cv-3943 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (not voluntarily) (12/11/14)
39	Gonzalez v. Caron	8:10-cv-02188 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (12/6/11)
40	Guobadia v. Irowa	2:12-cv-4042 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (11/24/15)
41	Gurung v. Malhotra	1:10-cv-05086 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$1,458,335 (11/22/11)
42	Hara v. Mak	2:13-cv-02924 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (11/13/13)

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
43	Hernandez v. Attisha	3:09-cv-02257 (S.D.Cal.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (4/8/11)
44	Hussain v. Shaukat	1:16-cv-00322 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (10/2/17)
45	Jeganathan v. Krishnan	1:16-cv-06784 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled in the amount of \$35,000 (9/12/17)
46	Judavar v. Al Mannai	1:11-cv-00625 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (10/6/11)
47	Kiwanuka v. Bakilana	1:10-cv-01336 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (7/26/12)
48	Laamime v. Abouzaid	1:13-cv-00793 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (1/15/14)
49	Lagasan v. Al-Ghasel	1:14-cv-01035 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$749,351 (3/17/15)
50	Lagayan v. Odeh	1:15-cv-01953 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (9/20/16)
51	Lama v. Malik	2:13-cv-02846 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (12/9/16)
52	Leo v. Al Naser	1:08-cv-01263 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (6/1/11)
53	Lipenga v. Kambalame	8:14-cv-03980 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$1,223,672.70 (11/9/16)

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
54	Llanto v. Esmail	1:17-cv-01159 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (9/15/17)
55	Lunkes v. Yannai	1:12-cv-00630 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude; also includes sex trafficking)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (1/2/14)
56	Martinez v. Calimlim	2:08-cv-00810 (E.D.Wis.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled in the amount of \$1,000,000 (dismissed 1/20/11)
57	Masangcay v. Kamenetskaya	1:18-cv-03666 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
58	Mathai v. George	1:13-cv-00997 (N.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled in the amount of \$20,000 (2/9/16)
59	Maysaroh v. American Arab Communications, LLC	1:13-cv-01743 (D.D.C.) (later 1:14-cv-00866 (E.D.Va.))	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (12/16/14)
60	Mazengo v. Mzengi	1:07-cv-00756 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$1,059,348.79 (4/28/08)
61	Mbome v. Njie	4:18-cv-00597 (N.D.Tex.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
62	Meda v. Kogda	1:17-cv-06853 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
63	Midjan v. Chan	3:07-cv-01977 (N.D.Cal.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (dismissed 11/16/10)

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
64	Mistry v. Udawadia	5:12-cv-00034 (W.D.Ok.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (7/11/12)
65	Moratal v. Nolasco	1:10-cv-06008 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (10/19/12)
66	Moulouki v. Epee	1:14-cv-05532 (N.D.Ill.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Judgment for plaintiff in the amount of \$156,688 (jury award) (7/18/17)
67	Muchira v. Al-Rawaf	1:14-cv-00770 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (9/9/15) (judgment on some claims for defendants; Fourth Circuit affirmed (15-2198) (3/3/17))
68	Mugambiwa v. Chiweshe	1:17-cv-02541 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily, without prejudice) (12/4/17)
69	Munoz v. Rossi	1:13-cv-00884 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled in the amount of \$41,600 (3/26/14)
70	Nabong v. Paddayuman	1:17-cv-00400 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
71	Ndukwe v. Ndukwe	2:09-cv-06443 (D.N.J.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (9/8/10)
72	Oh v. Choi	1:11-cv-03764 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$934,052.98 (3/30/16)
73	Oluoch v. Orina	1:14-cv-421 (S.D.N.Y.) (prev: 11-cv-3117 (S.D.N.Y.))	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (4/17/17) (earlier case dismissed without prejudice)

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
74	Ouedraogo v. Bonkougou	1:15-cv-01345 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (9/30/15)
75	Pattaiso v. Alahmad	1:14-cv-00041 (M.D.Pa.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled with at least two defendants in the amount of \$3,000; amount (if any) unknown as to other defendants; (dismissed 9/28/15)
76	Paucar v. Marquez	13-cv-24067 (S.D.Fla.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (12/3/14)
77	Ramos v. Hoyle	1:08-cv-21809 (S.D.Fla.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled in the amount of \$500,000 (9/8/10)
78	Rana v. Islam	1:14-cv-1993 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Default judgment in the amount of \$856,535.31 (5/4/18) (original award vacated and remanded for revision by Second Circuit (16-3966) (4/6/18))
79	Rios Fun v. Pulgar	2:13-cv-03679 (D.N.J.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (not voluntarily); motion to dismiss granted on grounds of diplomatic immunity
80	Roe v. Howard**	1:16-cv-562 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude; also includes sex trafficking)	Judgment for plaintiff in the amount of \$3,000,000 (10/26/17)
81	Rong v. Hong Kong Entertainment, Ltd.	05-cv-48 (D.M.I.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (09/02/09)

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
82	Sabbithi v. Al Saleh	1:07-cv-115 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (2/2/12)
83	Sakala v. Milunga	8:16-cv-00790 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Judgment for plaintiff in the amount of \$49,654.18 (+ attorneys' fees TBD) (5/24/18)
84	Salgado v. Gunawardane	04-cv-7378 (C.D.Cal.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (6/16/05)
85	Samirah v. Sabhnani	2:08-cv-2970 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (dismissed 5/2/12)
86	Sanchez v. Ruiz	7:16-cv-00445 (S.D.Tex.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (1/4/18)
87	Sandigan v. Al-Emadi	1:15-cv-01691 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (without prejudice) (11/14/16)
88	Suarez v. Scudder	2:18-cv-05777 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing
89	Sulaiman v. Laram	1:16-cv-08182 (S.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (8/22/17)
90	Sulastri v. Halsey	2:12-cv-3538 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (voluntarily) (11/14/14)
91	Tamang v. Mehra	1:17-cv-00370 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (12/18/17)
92	Tekle v. Al Saud	1:18-cv-00211 (E.D.Va.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Ongoing

Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Alleging Domestic Servitude (2003-2018)				
	Name	Docket & Jurisdiction	Type	Status (as of November 2018)
93	Velez v. Sanchez	1:04-cv-04797 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (5/16/13) (with some defendants; claims against remaining defendant severed; summary judgment entered against remaining defendant)
94	Villarreal v. Tenorio	8:11-cv-2147 (D.Md.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Dismissed (not voluntarily); motion to dismiss granted on grounds of diplomatic immunity (3/21/12)
95	Waru v. Madhvani	1:05-cv-00662 (D.D.C.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled (8/2/05)
96	Woods v. Armand	1:17-cv-02550 (E.D.N.Y.)	Forced labor (domestic servitude)	Settled in the amount of \$172,500 (2/28/18; judgment ordered on 6/25/18)

**Current as of November 30, 2018*

***Extraterritorial case involving US citizen defendants*

© 2018 The Human Trafficking Legal Center

Citation: The Human Trafficking Legal Center, Federal Civil Human Trafficking Cases Involving Allegations of Domestic Servitude (December 2018).

This publication was made possible through generous funding provided by NEO Philanthropy.



About The Human Trafficking Legal Center

The Human Trafficking Legal Center is a not-for-profit, national legal clearinghouse for survivors of human trafficking. The Human Trafficking Legal Center creates a bridge between trafficking survivors and highly-skilled pro bono legal representation. Standing with trafficking survivors, the Center partners with pro bono law firms nationwide to hold traffickers accountable for their crimes. Pro bono litigators trained by the Human Trafficking Legal Center win compensation for survivors. With these recoveries, trafficking survivors can reclaim their lives. Since 2012, the Human Trafficking Legal Center has trained more than 3,700 pro bono attorneys and placed more than 280 trafficking-related matters at top law firms.

www.htlegalcenter.org